

Objective	Sub-Criteria	Contribution to Criteria		
		Sandhills	Western	Eastern
Assists Economic Development	Construction Cost	X Least expensive with a construction cost of \$380 to \$500M	XX Second highest construction cost of \$410 to \$680M (inc local road elements)	XXX Highest construction cost at \$610 to \$930M (inc local road elements)
	Property Cost	X Property largely already purchased. 20 -50 land parcels affected	XXX 200 - 300 land parcels affected	XXX 300 - 400 land parcels affected
	Operation Cost	X Increase in operational cost due to increase in road length	X Increase in operational cost due to increase in road length	XX Increase in operational cost due to increase in road length. More structures and local roads included in this option
	Incremental NPV	✓ Benefits to SH1 traffic.	✓ Benefits to SH1 traffic. Minor benefit to local traffic	✓✓ Benefits to SH1 traffic. Significant benefits also to local traffic
	Security of Transport System	✓ Second crossing of Waikanae River provides additional security.	✓ Second crossing of Waikanae River provides additional security.	✓✓ Two additional crossings of Waikanae River provides additional security.
	Contributing to high quality economic development	0 Provides new infrastructure to facilitate economic development. Adverse impacts on Waikanae North and Paraparumu Town Centre plans	✓ Provides new infrastructure to facilitate economic development. Adverse impacts on planned Waikanae North	✓✓ Provides new infrastructure to facilitate economic development. Facilitates planned development by providing local arterial.
	Contribution to the RONS Strategy	✓ Expressway provided for SH1, but would have a long lead time before commencement.	✓ Expressway provided for SH1, but would have a long lead time before commencement. Some local roading could be constructed in interim	✓✓ Expressway provided for SH1. Quick wins can be achieved through the provision of consented local road across Waikanae River to relieve pressure on SH1
	RMA process timeframes	XX Consenting is very risky. Could prove to be fatally flawed because of cultural impacts to Urupa near Waikanae River and environmental impacts to QE II wetlands north of Waikanae.	XX Consenting is very risky. Could prove to be fatally flawed because of cultural impacts to Urupa near Waikanae River and environmental impacts to QE II wetlands north of Waikanae. Many properties affected.	X Consenting very risky. Many properties affected. Less cultural and environmental impact than Sandhills and Western options.
	Property Purchase Risk	0 Majority of property is already purchased however there are still 20-50 affected properties that would require acquisition.	XX Significant property purchase required (200 - 300 properties)	XX Significant property purchase required (300 - 400 properties)
	Staging	XX Staging difficult as there are no "quick wins." Congestion on SH1 will continue to build until Expressway is opened.	✓ Some staging possible through local road provision in southern end while Expressway is design and consented, however traffic congestion into Waikanae continues to build until Expressway is opened.	✓✓ Can be staged through construction of local roads first while Expressway is designed and consented.
	Consenting Risk	XX Highly likely to be objected to by Takamore Trust, affected landowners, schools and KCDC making consenting very difficult.	XX Highly likely to be objected to by Takamore Trust, many affected landowners, and KCDC making consenting very difficult.	XX Highly likely to be objected to by many affected landowners.
Assists Safety and Personal Security	Crash Rates	✓✓ Significant safety improvements on SH1 likely due to removal of risk of high severity head on and right-turn-against crashes. Detailed analysis has not been undertaken.	✓✓ Significant safety improvements on SH1 likely due to removal of risk of high severity head on and right-turn-against crashes. Detailed analysis has not been undertaken.	✓ Significant safety improvements on SH1 likely due to removal of risk of high severity head on and right-turn-against crashes. Additional local roads may result in higher local crash rates. Detailed analysis has not been undertaken.
	Personal Security	- Insufficient work carried out. Not possible to provide meaningful comment on the differences between schemes.	- Insufficient work carried out. Not possible to provide meaningful comment on the differences between schemes.	- Insufficient work carried out. Not possible to provide meaningful comment on the differences between schemes.
	Urban amenity	XX Would adversely impact on the planned future town centre of Paraparumu and high quality residential development in Waikanae.	X Would impact on Paraparumu businesses but would not affect future development proposals for Paraparumu Town Centre. Would adversely impact planned high quality residential development in Waikanae.	X Would have an impact on Waikanae Town Centre and Paraparumu businesses on the existing SH1 but would not affect development proposals for Paraparumu Town Centre or Waikanae.
Improves Access and Mobility	Integration with Other Transport Modes	X No new local roads for improved bus routes. SH1 moved farther from rail stations resulting in less integration between modes.	0 New local road links in Raumati will facilitate some improved bus links. SH1 can integrate with rail in Paraparumu but is moved farther from Waikanae rail station, resulting in less integration between modes.	✓✓ New local arterial allows significantly improved bus links between Waikanae, Paraparumu and Raumati. SH1 remains close to rail stations facilitating better integration between modes.
	Improvements to Access and Mobility with the provision of the facility	✓ New expressway significantly improves mobility for through traffic. Old SH will be an improved environment for local vehicular trips, walking and cycling. Good potential for parallel walking / cycling routes. Additional interchanges on expressway may need to be provided to facilitate access to urban areas.	✓ New expressway significantly improves mobility for through traffic. Old SH will be an improved environment for local vehicular trips, walking and cycling. Good potential for parallel walking / cycling routes.	✓ New expressway significantly improves mobility for through traffic. Old SH will be an improved environment for local vehicular trips, walking and cycling. Good potential for parallel walking / cycling routes. New local arterial significantly improves access and mobility for local trips and new development opportunities.
	Improvements to Access and Mobility beyond the facility (e.g. pedestrian / cycle networks included in the transport package)	0 No improvements beyond facility.	✓ Limited new local roads mean improved choice of North-south routes for pedestrians and cyclists.	✓✓ New local roads mean improved choice of North-south routes for pedestrians and cyclists.
	Community linkages and connectivity	XX No new local linkages and would prevent the provision of future linkages across the expressway	0 Some new linkages in Raumati but would prevent the provisions of future linkages across the expressway north of Waikanae.	✓ New link across Waikanae River and new roads in Raumati. Some reduced permeability of SH1 in Waikanae town centre.
Protects and Promotes Public Health	Air Emissions	- At this stage an air quality assessment has not been carried out and insufficient data is available to judge impacts of options.	- At this stage an air quality assessment has not been carried out and insufficient data is available to judge impacts of options.	- At this stage an air quality assessment has not been carried out and insufficient data is available to judge impacts of options.
	Noise Emissions	- At this stage a noise assessment has not been carried out and insufficient data is available to judge impacts of options.	- At this stage a noise assessment has not been carried out and insufficient data is available to judge impacts of options.	- At this stage a noise assessment has not been carried out and insufficient data is available to judge impacts of options.
	Community services and facilities	XX Would place the Expressway next to two schools in Raumati. Would increase severance between coastal communities and services in the town centres.	0 Potential to benefit facilities in Paraparumu and Raumati but would increase severance between Waikanae Beach and Waikanae township.	✓ Potential to benefit facilities in Paraparumu and Raumati. Local arterial provides better access to community facilities for local trips.
	Recreation and reserve areas	XX Could impact on QE Park and wetlands north-west of Waikanae and pass close to Nga Manu nature reserve.	XX Could impact on wetlands north-west of Waikanae and pass close to Nga Manu nature reserve.	X Could impact on the Paraparumu Domain.
Ensures Environmental Sustainability	Opportunities for Travel Demand Management	✓ It is possible to use tolling both as a means of funding as a TDM tool.	✓ It is possible to use tolling both as a means of funding as a TDM tool.	✓ It is possible to use tolling both as a means of funding as a TDM tool.
	Land stability / geotechnical stability	X All routes go through areas of peat and soft ground.	X All routes go through areas of peat and soft ground.	X All routes go through areas of peat and soft ground.
	Coastal Marine Area and receiving environment	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts
	Groundwater	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts
	Natural habitats and fauna – coastal, terrestrial and streams	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts	- Detailed assessment necessary to determine impacts
	Landscapes	XX Would significantly impact dunes environment, and wetlands north west of Waikanae.	X Provision of local road along WLR route would alter dunes environment in Raumati. Expressway would affect wetlands north west of Waikanae	X Expressway follows an already heavily modified transport corridor. Local road elements along WLR route will alter dunes environment.
	Sites of cultural significance	XX Wahi tapu area to north west of Waikanae directly affected. Potential to affect battleground sites.	XX Wahi tapu area to north west of Waikanae directly affected. Could impact on memorial gates in Domain.	X Could impact on memorial gates in Domain and affect historic processional route through Waikanae.
	Population Displacement	0 Property largely already purchased. 20 -50 land parcels affected but potentially no private houses required.	XX Significant property purchase required (200 - 300 properties) but of these approximately only 100 are private houses.	XX Significant property purchase required (300 - 400 properties) but of these approximately only around 150 are private houses.

LTMA

Investment and Revenue Strategy	Strategic Fit	✓✓ (High) Expressway contributes to RONS strategy.	✓✓ (High) Expressway contributes to RONS strategy.	✓✓ (High) Expressway contributes to RONS strategy.
	Effectiveness	0 (Low). Is not consistent with accepted strategies and land use plans	0 (Low). Is not consistent with accepted strategies and land use plans	✓✓ (High). Meets medium and low criteria and also improves intergration with land use and other transport modes and supports networks from a national perspective.
	Economic Efficiency	0 (Low). BCR 0.6 to 1.0	0 (Low). BCR 0.5 to 0.8	0 (Low). BCR 0.4 to 0.6
Government Policy Statement	Contribute to Economic Growth and Productivity	✓ Expressway expected to facilitate economic growth by reducing travel times. Location of interchanges will affect access to new development areas.	✓ Expressway expected to facilitate economic growth by reducing travel times. Location of interchanges will affect access to new development areas.	✓✓ Expressway expected to facilitate economic growth by reducing travel times. Location of interchanges will affect access to new development areas. New local arterial will contribute to regional growth plans and higher-quality development.
	Consider Networks from a National Perspective	✓✓ Expressway will contribute to better connections to Wellington and Palmerston North, reducing journey times and congestion.	✓✓ Expressway will contribute to better connections to Wellington and Palmerston North, reducing journey times and congestion.	✓✓ Expressway will contribute to better connections to Wellington and Palmerston North, reducing journey times and congestion.
	Achieving Value for Money	X BCR 0.6 to 1.0	X BCR 0.5 to 0.8	X BCR 0.4 to 0.6
	Encouraging Integrated Planning	XX Expressway plans directly conflict with KCDC's plans for Kapiti and do not provide for local transport links.	XX Expressway plans directly conflict with KCDC's plans for Kapiti and provide for only limited local transport links.	✓✓ Expressway plans facilitates KCDC's aspirations for Paraparaumu town centre and Waikanae North. Allow for local arterial construction which is consistent with regional growth plans.
	Making best use of existing networks and infrastructure	X Requires construction of new expressway for state highway traffic however local traffic continues to use existing infrastructure.	X Requires construction of new expressway for state highway traffic. Additional local infrastructure between Paraparaumu and Waikanae.	XX Requires construction of new expressway for state highway traffic. Significant local road improvements also required.
	Implementing and fostering a co-ordinated approach	XX Expressway plans directly conflict with KCDC's plans for Kapiti.	XX Expressway plans directly conflict with KCDC's plans for Kapiti.	0 Expressway plans do not directly conflict with KCDC's aspirations.
	Considering the impact of volatile fuel prices	- Option assessment has not considered different fuel prices.	- Option assessment has not considered different fuel prices.	- Option assessment has not considered different fuel prices.
National Energy Efficiency and Conservation Strategy	Managing demand for travel	X Likely to generate an increase in car-based travel	X Likely to generate an increase in car-based travel	X Likely to generate an increase in car-based travel
	More efficient transport modes	✓ Significant improvements to state highway traffic. No improvements to local traffic. Not likely to encourage efficiency of PT.	✓ Significant improvements to state highway traffic. Some improvements to local traffic between Paraparaumu and Raumati. May encourage efficiency in bus services between Paraparaumu and Raumati.	✓ Significant improvement to state highway and local traffic. Likely to encourage efficiency of bus services between Waikanae, Paraparaumu and Raumati.
Wellington Land Transport Strategy	A safer, more reliable road and rail corridor	✓✓ Expressway will contribute to better connections to Wellington and Palmerston North, reducing journey times and congestion and reducing accident risk on SH1.	✓✓ Expressway will contribute to better connections to Wellington and Palmerston North, reducing journey times and congestion and reducing accident risk on SH1.	✓✓ Expressway will contribute to better connections to Wellington and Palmerston North, reducing journey times and congestion and reducing accident risk on SH1.
	User expectations for a consistent regional corridor are met	✓✓ Expressway contributes to RONS strategy which is a consistent strategy for an expressway between north of Levin and Wellington Airport.	✓✓ Expressway contributes to RONS strategy which is a consistent strategy for an expressway between north of Levin and Wellington Airport.	✓✓ Expressway contributes to RONS strategy which is a consistent strategy for an expressway between north of Levin and Wellington Airport.
	Reduced congestion in parts of the corridor	✓✓ Congestion will be alleviated at key pinch points including Kapiti Road Traffic Lights and Waikanae Traffic Lights.	✓✓ Congestion will be alleviated at key pinch points including Kapiti Road Traffic Lights and Waikanae Traffic Lights.	✓✓ Congestion will be alleviated at key pinch points including Kapiti Road Traffic Lights and Waikanae Traffic Lights.
	Balanced investment in road and passenger transport, along with Travel Demand Management	X Investment is focused on building Expressway for SH1	✓ As well as expressway provision, local road will facilitate improved bus links between Raumati and Paraparaumu.	✓✓ As well as expressway provision, provides additional local roads which will facilitate local bus services between Waikanae, Paraparaumu and Raumati. Also provides good links to the railway network.

Key

✓✓	Strong Positive Contribution to Objective
✓	Positive Contribution to Objective
0	No significant Change in Contribution to Objective
X	Negative Contribution to Objective
XX	Strong Negative Contribution to Objective
-	Not assessed or insufficient information at this time