

31 July 2023

[REDACTED]

REF: OIA-12109

Dear [REDACTED]

Request made under the Official Information Act 1982

Thank you for your 13 letters received on 27 and 28 February 2023 requesting information relating to the National Ticketing Solution (NTS) under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act).

Waka Kotahi NZ Transport Agency has consulted you on the scope of the various parts of your request in emails. You clarified parts of your request in emails on 8 March 2023, 13 March 2023, 21 March 2023 and 11 May 2023.

I have numbered each part of your request for convenience and will answer the parts of your request in tranches.

1. Does the scope of the National Ticketing System, currently awarded to Cubic, include the services of Systems Integration? If not, have these services been procured? If they have, to who and when?

Cubic has been awarded the contract for the Ticketing Solution part of the NTS, please note that this is not the whole NTS. As set out in the Ticketing Solution RFP, as provided to all shortlisted respondents, including Thales, the scope of the Ticketing Solution under the NTS procurement includes systems integration services. The scope of the services to be provided under the contract awarded for the Ticketing Solution includes systems integration.

2. All status papers or reports relating to the National Ticketing System, prepared by or on behalf of the Project NEXT Steering Committee – if necessary, this can be limited to the year 2020, 2021, 2022 and 2023.

In your email of 11 May 2023, you withdrew this part of your request, and so I have not responded to this query.

3. Minutes from any Project NEXT Steering Committee meetings – if necessary, this can be limited to the year 2020, 2021, 2022 and 2023

In your email of 21 March 2023, you clarified the timeframe for this question to be between August 2021 and March 2023.

The documents in the attached schedule fall within the scope of your request and are enclosed.

Certain information has been withheld in these documents under sections:

- 9(2)(b)(ii) to protect the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information
- 9(2)(g)(i) to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinions by or between or to Ministers of the Crown or members of any organisation or officers and employees of any public service agency or organisation in the course of their duty
- 9(2)(a) to protect the privacy of natural persons
- 9(2)(j) to enable a Minister of the Crown or any public service agency or organisation holding the information to carry out, without prejudice or disadvantage, commercial activities.

4. In the Detailed Business Case Iteration 6, there are Capital and Operating Expenditure cost estimates for the Shared Services Organisation over the life of the National Ticketing System – We are requesting these figures please. These are internal Waka Kotahi costs, funded by the ratepayer, and therefore should not be commercially sensitive

These figures include costs or can be extrapolated to infer costs that relate to third party providers. Therefore, I am withholding this information under section 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information.

5. Any feasibility studies, interim reviews, project reviews, strategic reviews, impact analysis, cost-benefit reviews, analyses or similar that were either prepared by Waka Kotahi, or prepared for on behalf of Waka Kotahi by any third parties, in 2022 – This is for any reports either commissioned or delivered in 2022

In your email of 13 March 2023, you clarified this part of your request with the following:

Let's limit this to any project reviews or project assessments – i.e. reports into the veracity of any procurement, gate reviews etc that are part of the normal process for business cases, or any that WK commissioned as reviews for 2022

The following document falls within the scope of your request:

- Gateway Review – NZTA NTS Gate 0 and AAP Draft for SRO review

We are withholding the Gateway review itself in full under section 9(2)(ba)(i) of the Act.

6. How it is proposed that the Monetised Benefits used to calculate a positive BCR for the National Ticketing System will be measured, to ensure that the BCR was correct

A benefits management plan has been drafted and will evolve through the planning period of the NTS programme, before the 'go-live'. This plan will detail the approach and methodology that will be used to measure and realise the benefits of the NTS. This is standard project management methodology.

7. Any other proposed measurements of success for the National Ticketing System and the year those benefits will be measured

The benefits management measures and realisation are scheduled to be agreed by the NTS Governance Board in the near future and benefits will start accruing from the point of the first implementation of NTS, which is currently planned in mid-2024.

8. Please confirm the number of supplier employees or contractors engaged locally or currently resident in New Zealand

There are multiple current and anticipated suppliers (including their sub-contractors) to Waka Kotahi in respect of the NTS.

Waka Kotahi does not hold information on the number of employees or contractors engaged locally or currently resident in New Zealand, and so we are refusing this part of your request under section 18(g) of the Act because the information requested is not held by Waka Kotahi and I have no grounds for believing that the information is either held by another organisation or connected more closely with the functions of another organisation.

9. Was a NZ presence a requirement of the National Ticketing System Procurement - If there are none, when are these to be located in New Zealand?

Yes, this was set out in the Ticketing Solution Request for Proposal, which was provided to all shortlisted respondents, including Thales.

10. Project NEXT under Waka Kotahi, released an FRP/RFT for Financial Services for the National Ticketing System in 2018/19 – Can Waka Kotahi please confirm that this tender has ever been awarded? If it has been awarded – to who and when?

Subsequent to our response to this question in the document titled *Thales Debrief Report - Supplementary Information* provided to Thales on 14 February 2023, we have signed an agreement with Activata Prepay Limited as the retail network manager. The rest of the position of Waka Kotahi remains as stated in that response.

11. Previous iterations of the Detailed Business Case – Iteration 4 and 5

The following documents fall within the scope of this part of your request and are enclosed:

- Attachment 26 - 2021-12-08 NTS DBC Iteration 4 v1 DRAFT CW Amendments
- Attachment 27 - 2022-04-13 NTS DBC Iteration 5 v1.3.

Certain information has been withheld from these two documents under sections 9(2)(a), 9(2)(b)(ii) and 9(2)(ba)(i) of the Act.

12. Any iterations of the detailed business case where the Benefit Cost Ratio was less than 1

The following document falls within the scope of this part of your request and is enclosed:

- Attachment 28 - 2021-12-08 NTS DBC Iteration 3 v1.2 DRAFT

Certain information has been withheld from this document under section 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act.

13. The internal and external independent quality assurance reviews which were completed on the Detailed Business Case and referenced in the above Board Paper

The following document falls within this part of your request and is enclosed:

- Attachment 32 – 8.2 NTS - RC doc 2 - NTS Business Case IQA Report - Jul 2022

Certain information has been withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act. This section allows for the withholding of information to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information.

Information has also been withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act. This section allows for the withholding of information to protect the privacy of natural persons.

15. In an Official Information Act Request dated 24 November 2022 and published on the Waka Kotahi website, Waka Kotahi states “please not that a customer of current ticketing systems, such as Snapper and HOP, are either at or close to the end of their life, necessitating upgrades which would have cost a comparable amount to replace” - Can Waka Kotahi please provide the evidence it relied upon when making this statement that replacement systems would cost approximately \$1.3 billion

The NTS DBC does not state that replacement systems would cost approximately \$1.3 billion. The DBC is structured whereby the cost of NTS across a 15-year period was compared against two scenarios, being an ‘incremental upgrade’ or a ‘do nothing’ option. Costs for these scenarios were generated based upon existing known costs.

As no information exists which states that “replacement systems would cost approximately \$1.3 billion”, I am refusing this part of your request under s18(g) of the Act as Waka Kotahi does not hold this information and I have no reason for believing that it is held by another department (for itself and for a departmental agency hosted by it or an interdepartmental executive board serviced by it) or interdepartmental venture or Minister of the Crown or organisation, or by a local authority, or is more closely related to such.

16. Any communications between Waka Kotahi and Minister Wood or Minister Woods office, relating to the contract negotiation, award or procurement process for the National Ticketing System. If this is a lot of information then we can limit it to the years 2021 and 2022

In your email of 21 March 2023, you clarified the timeframe this question to be 2022.

Our internal email sweep indicated that approximately 500 emails could potentially fall within the scope of this part of your request. Therefore, I am refusing this part of your request under section 18(f) of the

Act, because the information requested cannot be made available without substantial collation or research. Attempting to undertake a response to this part of your request would place a significant burden on the NTS programme and the normal operations of Waka Kotahi.

We have considered whether charging for responding to this part of your request would help, as required by section 18A of the Act. However, even after extending the request for a significant period of time, the staff time that would be involved precludes us from undertaking this work.

We have consulted with you, as required by section 18B of the Act. However, we have been unable to come to a satisfactory resolution in relation to this aspect of your request and so refusal is the only option remaining to us.

17. Any reports prepared for the National Ticketing System as part of the Cabinet Approval Process, including

- **Risk profile assessments**
- **Indicative business cases**
- **Any other reports or documents provided as part of a review, approval or sign off process**

The NTS did not go through a Cabinet process, therefore I am refusing this part of your request under section 18(e) as the document alleged to contain the information requested does not exist.

18. All papers relating to the National Ticketing System that were put before the Waka Kotahi Board (including any Board sub-committees such as Risk and Assurance) between January 2019 and November 2022

The following documents fall within scope of this request and are detailed in the document schedule below.

Certain information has been withheld in these documents under sections:

- 9(2)(b)(ii) to protect the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information
- 9(2)(ba)(i) to protect information which is subject to an obligation of confidence or which any person has been or could be compelled to provide under the authority of any enactment, where the making available of the information would be likely to prejudice the supply of similar information, or information from the same source, and it is in the public interest that such information should continue to be supplied
- 9(2)(a) to protect the privacy of natural persons
- 9(2)(h) to maintain legal professional privilege.

19. Any minutes from NZTA Board meetings (including any Board sub-committees such as Risk and Assurance) that relate to or mention the National Ticketing Solution

On 8 March 2023, we emailed you seeking clarification on the timeframe of the information being requested, and to confirm that the timeframe is between January 2019 and November 2022. On 13 March 2023, you clarified question 19 to be for the following:

That's fine, but can we also ensure we include any outcomes of the papers, i.e. if they were asking for approval were they approved, if there were changes or further information requested, then the quick note of the outcome of the submission.

The following documents relate to minutes from the Risk and Assurance committee and fall within the scope of this request and are enclosed:

- Attachment 44 - 01.1 Minutes for approval Risk and Assurance 24 May 2022
- Attachment 45 - 01.2 Draft Minutes Risk and Assurance Committee 21 September 2022
- Attachment 46 - 01.2_Minutes_for_approval_-_2021_09_17_Risk___Assurance_Special_Committee

Certain information in Attachment 46 is being withheld under section 9(2)(a) to protect privacy, and under section 9(2)(g)(i) as free and frank advice.

With respect to the information that has been withheld from our response to your request, as outlined throughout this letter, I do not consider there are any other factors which would render it desirable, in the public interest, to make the information available.

Under section 28 of the Act, you have the right to ask the Ombudsman to review my decision to withhold this information and refuse part of this request. The contact details for the Ombudsman can be located at www.ombudsman.parliament.nz.

In line with Waka Kotahi policy, this response will soon be published on our website, with personal information removed.

If you would like to discuss this reply with Waka Kotahi, please contact the Ministerial Services team, by email to official.correspondence@nzta.govt.nz.

Yours sincerely



Yogesh Anand

NTS Executive Sponsor and Delivery Executive

OIA-12109 Document Schedules

Question 3 Document Schedule

Ref	Document	Date	Description
1.	ITEM 01 - Draft Minutes 1 December 2021 v0.1	1 December 2021	Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).
2.	ITEM 01 - Draft Minutes 15 September 2021	15 September 2021	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).
3.	ITEM 01 - Draft Minutes 18 August 2021	18 August 2021	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
4.	ITEM 01 - Draft Minutes 20 October 2021	20 October 2021	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
5.	ITEM 01 - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 15 June 2022	15 June 2022	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).
6.	ITEM 01 - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 16 February 2022	16 February 2022	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).
7.	ITEM 01 - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 16 March 2022	16 March 2022	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).

			<p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p> <p>Certain information withheld under section 9(2)(j).</p>
8.	ITEM 01 - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 17 August 2022	17 August 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p>
9.	ITEM 01 - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 18 May 2022	18 May 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>
10.	ITEM 01 - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 20 April 2022	20 April 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>
11.	ITEM 01 - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 20 July 2022	20 July 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>
12.	ITEM 01 -NTS Draft Minutes 15 December 2021 v0.1	15 December 2021	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>
13.	ITEM 01 -NTS Draft Minutes 26 January 2022 v0.1	26 January 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p>
14.	ITEM 01a - Draft Minutes 13 October 2021	13 October 2021	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p>

			Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
15.	ITEM 01a - Draft Minutes 27 August 2021	27 August 2021	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
16.	ITEM 01a - Draft Minutes 3 November 2021	3 November 2021	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
17.	ITEM 01a - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 03 August 2022	3 August 2022	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
18.	ITEM 01a - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 10 May 2022	10 May 2022	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
19.	ITEM 01a - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 2 March 2022	2 March 2022	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).
20.	ITEM 01a - NTS Steering Group Workshop Minutes - 27 May 2022	27 May 2022	Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).

21.	ITEM 01a -NTS Draft Minutes 9 February 2022 v0.1	9 February 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>
22.	ITEM 01b - NTS Steering Group Minutes - 2 June 2022	2 June 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p>
23.	NTS Steering Group Minutes - 02 September 2022	2 September 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>
24.	NTS Steering Group Minutes - 14 September 2022	14 September 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>
25.	NTS Steering Group Minutes - 18 October 2022	18 October 2022	<p>Certain information is withheld under section 9(2)(a).</p> <p>Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i).</p>

Question 18 Document Schedule

Ref	Document	Date	Description
29.	03. National Ticketing Solution - Request for Proposals 15-04-2020	15 April 2020	Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).
30.	08. National Ticketing Dec 2021 16-12-2021	16 December 2021	Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii). Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(ba)(i).
31.	8. NTS Business Case 07-07-2022	7 July 2022	Release in full.
32.	8.2 NTS - RC doc 2 - NTS Business Case IQA Report - Jul 2022	July 2022	Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(a), and section 9(2)(b)(ii).
33.	8.3 NTS - RC doc 3- NTS Governance Review 30 May 2022	30 May 2022	Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(a).
34.	09._Risk_and_Assurance_Committee_report_back_27-09-2022	27 September 2022	Release in full.
35.	10. Risk and Assurance Committee Report Back 23-09-2021	23 September 2021	Release in full.
36.	16. Risk_Assurance Committee report back 25-05-2022	25 May 2022	Release in full.
37.	17. National Ticketing Project 24-02-2020	24 February 2020	Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(h).
38.	17.1 Attachment 1 - National Ticketing - the story so far	February 2020	Release in full.
39.	17.2 Attachment 2 - Framework of a contract - Subscription Agreement	2020	Release in full.
40.	17.3 Attachment 3 - Next Business Case Executive Summary	January 2020	Release in full.
41.	03._National_Ticketing_Solution 17-09-2021	17 September 2021	Release in full.
42.	03.1_Attachment_1_-_Key_Risks_and_Mitigations	7 September 2021	Release in full.
43.	RC 03 Document 1 - National Ticketing Solution slide deck - main version	September 2021	Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii).